California Energy Commission

STAFF REPORT

LOCALIZED HEALTH IMPACTS REPORT

Addendum 3 for Projects With Location Changes Awarded Funding Through the Alternative and Renewable Fuel and Vehicle Technology Program Under Solicitation GFO-15-601 – DC Fast Chargers for California's North-South Corridors

California Energy Commission

Edmund G. Brown Jr., Governor

May 2018 | CEC-600-2016-002-AD3

California Energy Commission

Patrick Brecht
Primary Author

Brian Fauble
Shaun Ransom
Project Managers

Elizabeth John
Office Manager
ADVANCED FUEL PRODUCTION OFFICE

John P. Butler II
Acting Deputy Director
FUELS AND TRANSPORTATION DIVISION

Drew Bohan
Executive Director

ADDENDUM 3

The *Localized Health Impacts (LHI) Report for Selected Projects Awarded Funding Through the Alternative and Renewable Fuel and Vehicle Technology Program Under Solicitation GFO-15-601* was posted March 11, 2016 (CEC-600-2016-002).[1] This addendum uses the same approach to assess the localized health impacts for projects with location changes. ChargePoint, Inc. has proposed two new replacement electric vehicle direct current (DC) fast charging station locations, and EV Connect, Inc. has proposed six new replacement electric vehicle DC fast charging station locations. The newly proposed locations are described in Table 1, along with environmental justice (EJ) indicators.[2] (See Appendix A.) Charger quantity and type for the new locations are identical to the original proposals.

Table 1: Original and New Site Locations for ChargePoint and EV Connect, Along With Environmental Justice Indicators

Grantee	Original Locations	New Locations	EJ Indicator(s)
ChargePoint	31785 The Old Road Castaic, CA 91384	27983 Sloan Canyon Road Castaic, CA 91384	Unemployment
ChargePoint	49715 Gorman School Road Lebec, CA 93243	73 Frazier Mountain Park Road Lebec, CA 93243	Poverty and Unemployment
EV Connect	3100 Camino Del Rio Court Bakersfield, CA 93308	3540 Rosedale Highway Bakersfield, CA 93308	Poverty, Unemployment, Minority, and Age
EV Connect	601 Woollomes Avenue Delano, CA 93215	14390 County Line Road Delano, CA 93215	Poverty, Unemployment, and Minority
EV Connect	3175 Highland Avenue Selma, CA 93662	216 Ventura Court Kingsburg, CA 93631	Poverty, Unemployment, and Minority

1 Brecht, Patrick, 2016. *Localized Health Impacts Report*. California Energy Commission, Fuels and Transportation Division. Publication Number: CEC-600-2016-002.

2 The EJ indicators follow: (i.) minority subset represents more than 30 percent of a given city's population (2010), (ii.) city's poverty exceeds California's poverty level of 15.8 percent (2012-2016), (iii.) city's unemployment rate exceeds California's unemployment rate of 4.3 percent as of February 2018, and (iv.) city's percentage of persons younger than 5 years of age or older than 65 years of age is 20 percent higher than California's average. For the entire state, the percentage of persons under the age of 5 years is 6.8 percent, and the percentage of persons over the age of 65 years is 11.4 percent.

Grantee	Original Locations	New Locations	EJ Indicator(s)
EV Connect	93 Via Pico Plaza San Clemente, CA 92672	111 S Avenue De La Estrella San Clemente, CA 92672	None
EV Connect	17047 Zachary Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93308	2700 S Blackstone Street Tulare, CA 93274	Poverty, Unemployment, Minority, and Age
EV Connect	3643 South Mooney Boulevard Visalia, CA 93277	9000 W Airport Drive Visalia, CA 93227	Poverty, Unemployment, Minority, and Age

Source: California Energy Commission staff

Air Quality and EJ Indicators

The newly proposed station locations (electric vehicle charging stations) are all in nonattainment zones for ozone, particulate matter (PM^3) 2.5, and PM 10. If a project site is in a nonattainment zone and has more than one EJ indicator, as shown in Table 1, with detail in Table 2, it is considered a high-risk community, according to the Environmental Justice Screening Method.[4] According to staff's assessment, Bakersfield, Delano, Lebec, Kingsburg, Tulare, and Visalia are all considered high-risk communities.

3 "Particulate matter" is unburned fuel particles that form smoke or soot and stick to lung tissue when inhaled. The numbers stand for microns in diameter.

4 California Air Resources Board (ARB), *Air Pollution and Environmental Justice, Integrating Indicators of Cumulative Impact and Socio-Economic Vulnerability Into Regulatory Decision-Making, 2010*. (Sacramento, California) Contract authors: Manuel Pastor Jr., Ph.D., Rachel Morello-Frosch, Ph.D., and James Sadd, Ph.D.

Table 2: Environmental Justice (EJ) Indicators Compared With California
The yellow highlighted area indicates numbers (%) that meet the definition for EJ indicators
An asterisk may signify a default to county demographics and/or labor information.

	Below Poverty Level (2012 – 2016)	Black Persons (2010)	American Indian and/or Alaska Native (2010)	Asian and/or Pacific Islander (2010)	Persons of Hispanic or Latino Origin (2010)	Persons Under 5 Years of Age (2010)	Persons Over 65 Years of Age (2010)	Unemployment (February 2018)
California	15.8%	6.2%	1.0%	13.0%	37.6%	6.8%	11.4%	4.3%
EJ Indicator Threshold	>15.8%	>30%	>30%	>30%	>30%	>8.16%	>13.8%	>4.3%
Bakersfield	19.7%	8.2%	1.5%	6.2%	45.5%	9.0%	8.4%	7.8%
Castaic*	7.2%	3.3%	0.6%	11.4%	24.8%	6.8%	5.7%	4.7%
Delano	29.2%	7.9%	0.9%	12.7%	71.5%	8.0%	6.1%	11.5%
Lebec	22.8%	1.0%	3.1%	1.2%	26.9%	5.7%	13.5%	18.6%
Kingsburg	17.8%	0.5%	1.3%	3.4%	42.9%	8.0%	12.8%	7.3%
San Clemente	7.1%	0.6%	0.6%	3.7%	16.8%	6.5%	13.2%	2.5%
Tulare	22.2%	3.9%	1.2%	2.2%	57.5%	9.4%	9.0%	9.4%
Visalia	22.1%	2.1%	1.4%	5.4%	46.0%	8.6%	10.3%	8.3%

Sources: Unemployment information from the State of California, Employee Development Department Labor Market Information Div.: http://www.labormarketinfo.edd.ca.gov/data/unemployment-and-labor-force.html#Tool. U.S. Census Bureau, http://www.census.gov/quickfacts/table/PST045215/0664000,06,00 and http://factfinder.census.gov/faces/nav/jsf/pages/community_facts.xhtml

Location Analysis and Community Impacts

The proposed station locations were assessed according to the original LHIs. The environmental justice indicators are comparable to the original set of station locations. The charger quantity and type, along with the estimated gasoline gallons displaced, are also comparable, and the anticipated impact to the communities where the electric vehicle chargers will be located remains positive in terms of cleaner air and anticipated greenhouse gas reductions.

APPENDIX A:
Localized Health Impact Report Assessment Method

This LHI Report assesses the potential impacts to communities because of the projects proposed by the ARFVTP. This report is prepared under the *California Code of Regulations, Title 13, Motor Vehicles, Chapter 8.1 (CCR § 2343)*:

(6) Localized health impacts must be considered when selecting projects for funding. The funding agency must consider environmental justice consistent with state law and complete the following:

> (A) For each fiscal year, the funding agency must publish a staff report for review and comment by the public at least 30 calendar days prior to approval of projects. The report must analyze the aggregate locations of the funded projects, analyze the impacts in communities with the most significant exposure to air contaminants or localized air contaminants, or both, including, but not limited to, communities of minority populations or low-income populations, and identify agency outreach to community groups and other affected stakeholders.
>
> (B) Projects must be selected and approved for funding in a publicly noticed meeting.

This LHI Report is not intended to be a detailed environmental health impact analysis of proposed projects nor is it intended to substitute for the environmental review conducted during the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) review. This LHI Report includes staff's application of the Environmental Justice Screening Method (EJSM) to identify projects located in areas with social vulnerability indicators and the greatest exposure to air pollution and associated health risks.[5]

The EJSM was developed to identify low-income communities highly affected by air pollution for assessing the impacts of climate change regulations, specifically Assembly Bill 32 (Núñez, Chapter 488, Statutes of 2006), the California Global Warming Solutions Act of 2006. The EJSM integrates data on (1) exposure to air pollution, (2) cancer risk, (3) ozone concentration, (4) frequency of high ozone days, (5) race/ethnicity, (6) poverty level, (7) home ownership, (8) median household value, (9) educational attainment, and (10) sensitive populations (populations under 5 years of age or over 65 years of age).

5 California Air Resources Board (ARB). *Air Pollution and Environmental Justice, Integrating Indicators of Cumulative Impact and Socio-Economic Vulnerability Into Regulatory Decision-Making, 2010.* (Sacramento, California) Contract authors: Manuel Pastor Jr., Ph.D., Rachel Morello-Frosch, Ph.D., and James Sadd, Ph.D.

To determine high-risk communities, environmental justice (EJ) indicators for locations of the electric vehicle charging stations are compared to data from the U.S. Census Bureau or other public agency. Staff identifies high-risk communities by using a two-part standard. For a community to be considered high-risk, for this assessment, it must meet both Parts 1 and 2 of this standard.

Part 1:

- Communities located in nonattainment air basins for ozone, PM 2.5 or PM 10

Part 2:

- Communities having more than one of the following EJ indicators: (1) minority, (2) poverty, (3) unemployment and (4) high percentage of population under 5 years of age and over 65 years of age. The EJ indicators follow:
    - A minority subset represents more than 30 percent of a given city's population.
    - A city's poverty level exceeds California's poverty level.
    - A city's unemployment rate exceeds California's unemployment rate.
    - The percentage of people living in that city are younger than 5 years of age or older than 65 years of age is 20 percent higher than the average percentage of persons under 5 years of age or over 65 years of age for all of California.